

<p>John Coon Laura Gardner read the scriptures that I posted , above. It is there.</p> <p>Additionally, I recommend you consider the historical realities of the sacred scriptures. The New Covenant/ New Testament scriptures were written by Holy Spirit inspired Catholic men. These books were gathered by Catholic Bishops with the authority to determine which books should be canonized and assembled as the infallible Word of God. They have been painstakingly codified, interpreted, copied by hand, preserved and passed on through the generations by Catholic religious monks and priests under the authority of the Holy Catholic Church founded by Jesus Christ (Matthew 16:18). This is the historical reality of the source material which we are discussing here in this thread. Therefore, I submit to the teaching authority of the Church that gave us the Bible. They are the authentic stewards of the Bible / The Holy Word of God with the authentic teachings that have been handed down by the men who walked with Jesus Christ in the flesh here on Earth, The Holy Apostles. Failure to humble one’s self to the authority of the Church which Christ established is an act of pride. This pride separates us from God, as He is perfect and makes those in this state likely to produce false interpretations that serve not God, but the self. Jesus Christ attributes two key virtues to Himself, as He says in Matthew 11:29 Take up my yoke upon you, and learn of me, because I am meek, and humble of heart: And you shall find rest to your souls. Therefore, e like Christ, meek and humble. Follow the teaching authority that He, Himself establishes; whereas He established the Apostles, Luke 10:16 He that heareth you heareth me: and he that despiseth you despiseth me: and he that despiseth me despiseth him that sent me. These Apostles laid hands on men passing on the Apostolic succession found in the Holy Catholic Church, today. (John 14:18 & Acts 6:6). May the Peace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with you.</p>	<p>This should be interesting.</p> <p>John, you wrote, ‘I submit to the teaching authority of the Church that gave us the Bible.’ When did Rome give anyone the TaNaK? That was established centuries before the NT times.</p> <p>When did the Catholic bishops gather them. I know of Carthage and Hippo but, if memory serves, they were local councils were they not; serving only as information and not authority. The only authorative council to pronounce on the canon was the 17th century council of Trent! And at that time Cardinal Cajetan said rather forcefully that Jerome is to be followed (Jewish-Protestant Canon) and not Augustine.</p> <p>You, like many other Catholic apologists, work hard to subsume the authority of God’s Word under the authority of the Roman church. Are there other ‘authentic teachings that have been handed down’ outside of Scripture? If so, where can I find it to access it.</p> <p>You note Luke 10.16 and tie the authority of the Apostles with it but, if you read the text, the passage is directed to seventy (two) others, not the 12 alone. Those are disciples, which I would say any true follower of Christ is. Your error, like many others, is having turned the adjective ‘catholic/universal’ into a proper noun Roman Catholic thus robbing it of the original intent of the declaration of its universality. Instead, you have reduced it to a narrow, arrogant, unbliblical rule ridden entity that has little to anything at all to do with the Ekklesia of God’s Word. Your entity is anything but ‘meek and humble.’</p>
<p>^{DRA} Matthew 16:18 And I say to thee: That thou art Peter; and upon this rock I will build my church, and the gates of hell shall not prevail against it. (Matt. 16:18 DRA)</p> <p>^{DRA} Matthew 11:29 Take up my yoke upon you, and learn of me, because I am meek, and humble of heart: and you shall find rest to your souls. (Matt. 11:29 DRA)</p> <p>^{DRA} John 14:18 I will not leave you orphans, I will come to you. (Jn. 14:18 DRA)</p> <p>^{DRA} Acts 6:6 These they set before the apostles; and they praying, imposed hands upon them. (Acts 6:6 DRA)</p>	
<p>Robert Posch Jr. PURGATORY-When I was a Protestant I always wondered where the thousands who rose from the grave post crucifixion (Matt 27:52) or who Christ raised or Peter/apostles (Acts 9:36-41) ert etc...WHERE DID THEY COME FROM-were they liberated from hell ...kicked out of heaven-of course not-they were in Purgatory...1Cor 15:29 spoke of baptism for the dead-what is going on?</p>	<p>Robert, ‘thousands’?! You accuse me of not knowing Scripture; please show me in the text where it says ‘thousands’. The New Jerusalem Bible’s (Imprimatur Cardinal Hume) note on this passage suggests that the dead were in ‘Hades’ and this is in agreement with the Catechism (633). As it does with the other passages you cite. Who is right here counsellor? You or the Catechism? What does John say?</p>

DRA Matthew 27:52 And the graves were opened: and many bodies of the saints that had slept arose, (Matt. 27:52 DRA)
 DRA **Acts 9:40** And they all being put forth, Peter kneeling down prayed, and turning to the body, he said: Tabitha, arise. And she opened her eyes; and seeing Peter, she sat up. (Acts 9:40 DRA)
 DRA **1 Corinthians 15:29** Otherwise what shall they do that are baptized for the dead, if the dead rise not again at all? why are they then baptized for them?

Robert Posch Jr. NOTHING UNCLEAN WILL ENTER HEAVEN:Rev.21:27...his works will pass through fire 1Cor.3:11-15-so we know there is a stage between salvation and entering heaven -The metaphor of fire is throughout scripture-Dan7:9...Mal4:1...Matt3:12...Luke 3:16)etc....the bible is not ambiguous Matt 12:32...all our attachment to sin and selfishness as well as temporal punishment due to sin are purged in the cleansing power of God's love-the purging is purgatory-a specific place.

DRA **Revelation 21:27** There shall not enter into it any thing defiled, or that worketh abomination or maketh a lie, but they that are written in the book of life of the Lamb.
 DRA **Daniel 7:9** I beheld till thrones were placed, and the Ancient of days sat: his garment was white as snow, and the hair of his head like clean wool: his throne like flames of fire: the wheels of it like a burning fire. (Dan. 7:9 DRA)
 DRA **Malachi 4:1** For behold the day shall come kindled as a furnace: and all the proud, and all that do wickedly shall be stubble: and the day that cometh shall set them on fire, saith the Lord of hosts, it shall not leave them root, nor branch.
 DRA **Matthew 3:12** Whose fan is in his hand, and he will thoroughly cleanse his floor and gather his wheat into the barn; but the chaff he will burn with unquenchable fire. (Matt. 3:12 DRA)
 DRA **Luke 3:16** John answered, saying unto all: I indeed baptize you with water; but there shall come one mightier than I, the latchet of whose shoes I am not worthy to loose: he shall baptize you with the Holy Ghost, and with fire: (Lk. 3:16 DRA)
 DRA **Matthew 12:32** And whosoever shall speak a word against the Son of man, it shall be forgiven him: but he that shall speak against the Holy Ghost, it shall not be forgiven him, neither in this world, nor in the world to come. (Matt. 12:32 DRA)

Robert Posch Jr. DID CHRIST/the APOSTLES PRAY FOR THE DEAD-of course they were Jews and post jews-the requirement of charity never ended..(2Macc12:44-46 unambiguously sets out the Jewish requirement).St.Tim1:16-18 we see prayers for the dead..Peter of course does in Acts9:36-41...Not all are raised (Mark 5:35-43-Jairus's daughter stayed in Purgatory)..Jesus instructs the apostles to pray for the dead-and they do Matt11:5.Luke 7:22...Matt10:8...The saints in heaven pray for us on earth and purgatory Rev5:8..Rev 8:3-4)...

 there is no "saved by the blood"alone-the bible constantly refers to suffering as a means of attaining holiness and wisdom in Christ-Rom5:3-5...2Cor1:5...12:7-9...James 1:2-4,12...5:10-11...1Pet5:10...

See above – Catechism and Imprimatured Bible.

2 Ma. 12:40-46 DRA ⁴⁰ And they found under the coats of the slain some of the donaries of the idols of Jamnia, which the law forbiddeth to the Jews: so that all plainly saw, that for this cause they were slain.
⁴¹ Then they all blessed the just judgment of the Lord, who had discovered the things that were hidden.
⁴² And so betaking themselves to prayers, they besought him, that the sin which had been committed might be forgotten. But the most valiant Judas exhorted the people to keep themselves from sin, forasmuch as they saw before their eyes what had happened, because of the sins of those that were slain.
⁴³ And making a gathering, he sent twelve thousand drachms of silver to Jerusalem for sacrifice to be offered for the sins of the dead, thinking well and religiously concerning the resurrection,

⁴⁴ (For if he had not hoped that they that were slain should rise again, it would have seemed superfluous and vain to pray for the dead,)

⁴⁵ And because he considered that they who had fallen asleep with godliness, had great grace laid up for them.

⁴⁶ It is therefore a holy and wholesome thought to pray for the dead, that they may be loosed from sins. (2 Ma. 12:40-46 DRA)

2 Tim. 1:16-18 DRA ¹⁶ The Lord give mercy to the house of Onesiphorus: because he hath often refreshed me, and hath not been ashamed of my chain:

¹⁷ But when he was come to Rome, he carefully sought me, and found me.

¹⁸ The Lord grant unto him to find mercy of the Lord in that day: and in how many things he ministered unto me at Ephesus, thou very well knowest. (2 Tim. 1:16-18 DRA)

Acts 9:36-41 DRA ³⁶ And in Joppe there was a certain disciple named Tabitha, which by interpretation is called Dorcas. This woman was full of good works and almsdeeds which she did.

³⁷ And it came to pass in those days that she was sick, and died. Whom when they had washed, they laid her in an upper chamber.

³⁸ And forasmuch as Lydda was nigh to Joppe, the disciples hearing that Peter was there, sent unto him two men, desiring him that he would not be slack to come unto them.

³⁹ And Peter rising up, went with them. And when he was come, they brought him into the upper chamber. And all the widows stood about him weeping, and shewing him the coats and garments which Dorcas made them.

⁴⁰ And they all being put forth, Peter kneeling down prayed, and turning to the body, he said: Tabitha, arise. And she opened her eyes; and seeing Peter, she sat up.

⁴¹ And giving her his hand, he lifted her up. And when he had called the saints and the widows, he presented her alive.

Mk. 5:35-6:1 DRA ³⁵ While he was yet speaking, some come from the ruler of the synagogue's house, saying: Thy daughter is dead: why dost thou trouble the master any further?

³⁶ But Jesus having heard the word that was spoken, saith to the ruler of the synagogue: Fear not, only believe.

³⁷ And he admitted not any man to follow him, but Peter, and James, and John the brother of James.

³⁸ And they come to the house of the ruler of the synagogue; and he seeth a tumult, and people weeping and wailing much.

³⁹ And going in, he saith to them: Why make you this ado, and weep? the damsel is not dead, but sleepeth.

⁴⁰ And they laughed him to scorn. But he having put them all out, taketh the father and the mother of the damsel, and them that were with him, and entereth in where the damsel was lying.

⁴¹ And taking the damsel by the hand, he saith to her: Talitha cumi, which is, being interpreted: Damsel (I say to thee) arise.

⁴² And immediately the damsel rose up, and walked: and she was twelve years old: and they were astonished with a great astonishment.

⁴³ And he charged them strictly that no man should know it: and commanded that something should be given her to eat.

Matt. 11:4-5 DRA ⁴ And Jesus making answer said to them: Go and relate to John what you have heard and seen.

⁵ The blind see, the lame walk, the lepers are cleansed, the deaf hear, the dead rise again, the poor have the gospel preached to them.

Matt. 10:8 DRA ⁸ Heal the sick, raise the dead, cleanse the lepers, cast out devils: freely have you received, freely give.

Rev. 5:8 DRA ⁸ And when he had opened the book, the four living creatures, and the four and twenty ancients fell down before the Lamb, having every one of them harps, and golden vials full of odours, which are the prayers of saints: (Rev. 5:8 DRA)

Rev. 8:3-4 DRA ³ And another angel came, and stood before the altar, having a golden censer; and there was given to him much incense, that he should offer of the prayers of all saints upon the golden altar, which is before the throne of God. ⁴ And the smoke of the incense of the prayers of the saints ascended up before God from the hand of the angel.

Rom. 5:3-5 DRA ³ And not only so; but we glory also in tribulations, knowing that tribulation worketh patience;

⁴ And patience trial; and trial hope; ⁵ And hope confoundeth not: because the charity of God is poured forth in our hearts, by the Holy Ghost, who is given to us.

2 Cor. 1:5 DRA ⁵ For as the sufferings of Christ abound in us: so also by Christ doth our comfort abound. ()

2 Cor. 12:7-9 DRA ⁷ And lest the greatness of the revelations should exalt me, there was given me a sting of my flesh, an angel of Satan, to buffet me. ⁸ For which thing thrice I besought the Lord, that it might depart from me. ⁹ And he said to me: My grace is sufficient for thee; for power is made perfect in infirmity. Gladly therefore will I glory in my infirmities, that the power of Christ may dwell in me.

Jas. 1:2-4 DRA ² My brethren, count it all joy, when you shall fall into divers temptations;

³ Knowing that the trying of your faith worketh patience.

⁴ And patience hath a perfect work; that you may be perfect and entire, failing in nothing.

Jas. 5:10-11 DRA ¹⁰ Take, my brethren, for an example of suffering evil, of labour and patience, the prophets, who spoke in the name of the Lord.

¹¹ Behold, we account them blessed who have endured. You have heard of the patience of Job, and you have seen the end of the Lord, that the Lord is merciful and compassionate.

1 Pet. 5:10 DRA ¹⁰ But the God of all grace, who hath called us into his eternal glory in Christ Jesus, after you have suffered a little, will himself perfect you, and confirm you, and establish you.

Robert Posch Jr. Peter prayed for Tabitha and Jesus for Lazarus-that they may be raised from the dead.....In order for such a miracle to occur-the person prayed for must be dead...So praying for the dead is recorded in the written word of God...Thus it is God's will and entirely scriptural to pray for the dead-whatever God does is proper for men to imitate aka those following Christ pray for the souls in purgatory

Jesus's prayer before Lazarus was not that Lazarus be raised from the dead but rather 'Father, I give thee thanks that thou hast heard me. ⁴² And I knew that thou hearest me always; but because of the people who stand about have I said it, that they may believe that thou hast sent me. (Jn. 11:41-42 DRA)'
Acts just says that Peter prayed. It says nothing about what Peter prayed for.

Jn. 11:41-42 DRA ⁴¹ They took therefore the stone away. And Jesus lifting up his eyes said: Father, I give thee thanks that thou hast heard me.

⁴² And I knew that thou hearest me always; but because of the people who stand about have I said it, that they may believe that thou hast sent me.

Acts 9:39-40 DRA ³⁹ And Peter rising up, went with them. And when he was come, they brought him into the upper chamber. And all the widows stood about him weeping, and shewing him the coats and garments which Dorcas made them. ⁴⁰ And they all being put forth, Peter kneeling down prayed, and turning to the body, he said: Tabitha, arise. And she opened her eyes; and seeing Peter, she sat up.

Robert Posch Jr. SOLA SCRIPTURA IS NOT BIBLICAL AND LEADS TO ERROR-we know from scripture the bible relates very little of what Christ said and did-John 20:30...John 21:25...So pretending things like Purgatory,,,Sunday Sabbath ...Trinity.....the Bible....Incarnation etc etc etc aren't true because the bible doesn't have a word saying it-is just silly...WE KNOW FROM SCRIPTURE-the BIBLE IS NOT COMPLETE but Matt/Mark tell us-"heaven and earth will pass away-BUT MY WORDS WILL NOT PASS AWAY-since they're not in scripture-where are they???"The same pillar of truth and light -the church of the living God(1Tim3:15)...the same tradition that created the bible.....To say otherwise is to assert I BELIEVE IN A BOOK FOR NO REASON CREATED BY A CHURCH I DON'T BELIEVE IN.

As confident as you are it should be easy for you to cite that document that has the exact same authority as Scripture that established those doctrines. I have asked John the same thing. If 'the Bible is not complete' (really, really odd statement) where are the 'complete' documents found? If you say tradition make sure you note which one – the 'authoritative tradition' that somehow derives from the Apostles (again, show me your source) or the 'living tradition' that informs you on current practices (Marian mostly, but also Holy Days of Obligation, etc.) that are unrelated to the Apostles. Karl Rahner (Catholic Theologian, Writer, Professor) wrote (Dictionary of Theology, s.v. 'Tradition' noted that '... one can conclude that Tradition occurs always and everywhere in hearkening to Scripture, subject to Scripture as the critical norm which is always and everywhere necessary in order to distinguish 'divine' Tradition as the handing on of God's revelation of himself in Jesus Christ from human traditions. . . . it is not possible at least for us to prove with certainty that explicit matters of faith (apart from the scope of canon) were held in apostolic times which have not been recorded in Scripture, Scripture alone remains for all practical purposes the sole material source of the faith drawn upon by later Tradition.'

[Coon] St. Thomas Aquinas, The Angelic Doctor of the Church says, It is said (2 Maccabees 12:46): "It is a holy and wholesome thought to pray for the dead, that they may be loosed from sins." Now there is no need to pray for the dead who are in heaven, for they are in no need; nor again for those who are in hell, because they cannot be loosed from sins. Therefore after this life, there are some not yet loosed from sins, who can be loosed

Can they be loosed from mortal sins? They committed a mortal sin did they not-worshipping another god – violation of the 1st commandment, and the second, as they were bearing an image of that other god? And dying in a mortal sin puts you in hell and you just said that 'they cannot be loosed from sins.'

<p>therefrom; and the like have charity, without which sins cannot be loosed, for "charity covereth all sins" [Proverbs 10:12]. Hence they will not be consigned to everlasting death, since "he that liveth and believeth in Me, shall not die for ever" [John 11:26]: nor will they obtain glory without being cleansed, because nothing unclean shall obtain it, as stated in the last chapter of the Apocalypse (verse 14). Therefore some kind of cleansing remains after this life.</p>	
<p>^{DRA} John 11:26 And every one that liveth, and believeth in me, shall not die for ever. Believest thou this? ^{DRA} Revelation 22:14 Blessed are they that wash their robes in the blood of the Lamb: that they may have a right to the tree of life, and may enter in by the gates into the city. (Rev. 22:14 DRA)</p>	
<p>[Coon] Further, Gregory of Nyssa [De iis qui in fide dormiunt] [Coon] says: "If one who loves and believes in Christ," has failed to wash away his sins in this life, "he is set free after death by the fire of Purgatory." Therefore there remains some kind of cleansing after this life.</p>	<p>And yet John 3.16 (yeah, I know) says, ^{DRA} John 3:16 For God so loved the world, as to give his only begotten Son; that whosoever believeth in him, may not perish, but may have life everlasting. I do not notice a 'unless' on there.</p>
<p>[Posch] LUKE 16:17-32-I long believed this was purgatory-now Scott Hahn agrees and in his tapes on purgatory...Ironically a great Baptist Charle's Stanley's sermon on in Touch Ministries led me to this purgatory chapter...He was stressing no love/charity can exist in hell-and the damned are cut off....FATHER ABRAHAM is beseeched for his intercession for the rich man in purgatory...Abraham replied MY CHILD...how many in hell are being called "my child"-and being given an in depth theological answer..THIS IS NOT A PARABLE but a rare time Christ speaks of a factual situation...So we see unambiguously here the "dead"communicating-a dead man seeking intercession he expects...Another dead man (saint)-answers him specifically as a "CHILD OF ABRAHAM"who Abraham knows will after a period of purging of selfishness (the rich man lacked charity but did nothing damnable)-return to abraham's bussum...In the interim Abraham will console his child</p>	<p>Again, see my note above about what the Catechism says.</p>
<p>Lk. 16:20-17:1 ^{DRA} ²⁰ And there was a certain beggar, named Lazarus, who lay at his gate, full of sores, ²¹ Desiring to be filled with the crumbs that fell from the rich man's table, and no one did give him; moreover the dogs came, and licked his sores. ²² And it came to pass, that the beggar died, and was carried by the angels into Abraham's bosom. And the rich man also died: and he was buried in hell. ²³ And lifting up his eyes when he was in torments, he saw Abraham afar off, and Lazarus in his bosom: ²⁴ And he cried, and said: Father Abraham, have mercy on me, and send Lazarus, that he may dip the tip of his finger in water, to cool my tongue: for I am tormented in this flame. ²⁵ And Abraham said to him: Son, remember that thou didst receive good things in thy lifetime, and likewise Lazareth evil things, but now he is comforted; and thou art tormented. ²⁶ And besides all this, between us and you, there is fixed a great chaos: so that they who would pass from hence to you, cannot, nor from thence come hither. ²⁷ And he said: Then, father, I beseech thee, that thou wouldst send him to my father's house, for I have five brethren, ²⁸ That he may testify unto them, lest they also come into this place of torments. ²⁹ And Abraham said to him: They have Moses and the prophets; let them hear them. ³⁰ But he said: No, father Abraham: but if one went to them from the dead, they will do penance. ³¹ And he said to him: If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they believe, if one rise again from the dead.</p>	

<p>[Coon] Purgatory is a great mercy. Thank you, Jesus.</p>	<p>How is purgatory a great mercy? Only by negating the Blood of Christ! The sacrifice on Calvary was all sufficient – therefore no need for purgatory nor even the concept.</p>
<p>Robert Posch Jr. John Coon -well articulated...But remember in direct violation of sola scriptura (a lie they violate here to mock christ)-in violation of Rev22:18 and in violation of 2Tim2:3:15 (the 7 books incorporated in bible by reference) the protestant abridged bible lacks Maccabees,Mea culpa I left out 2/3 purgatory verses you cite but trust you understand don't have all off the top of my head-CHURCH FATHERS ALWAYS GREAT-to know history is to cease to be a protestant....To be in a sect you must reject all the 400 year history of the church-ALL THE CHURCH FATHERS WERE SAYING MASS...HEARING CONFESSION...VENERATING MARY-centuries before the catholic Church created the bible.</p>	<p>I love this – ‘to know history is to cease to be a protestant.’ I have read it many times by Catholic apologists; started with Newman if memory serves. Of course, for him, an Anglican, the Tiber was rather narrow. I have studied church history extensively, in courses and on my own. Have written papers on church history. And yet, here I remain. On the shore opposite Rome. On the far shore.</p>
<p>Rev. 22:18 DRA¹⁸ For I testify to every one that heareth the words of the prophecy of this book: If any man shall add to these things, God shall add unto him the plagues written in this book. 2 Tim. 3:15 DRA¹⁵ And because from thy infancy thou hast known the holy scriptures, which can instruct thee to salvation, by the faith which is in Christ Jesus.</p>	
<p>Robert Posch Jr. John Coon none of us would get in as the bible tells us (not a sword drill verse)-its a sin to claim we're without sin....BUT PURGATORY A GREAT GIFT TO PROTESTANTS-in their pride they never question 38,000 sects ALL IN DIRECT CONTEMPT OF CHRIST IN JOHN 17...John 17 isn't a sword drill verse but of course christ WANTS ALL IN ONE DOCTRINE-its absurd to think there will be 38,000 sects in heaven opposing Christ's church...So the Protestants saved will be PURGED of error as well as sin.</p>	<p>Jesus and Hanukkah. Yeah? So? He participated in synagogue and those weren't mentioned in Scripture.</p>
<p>John Coon If the Maccabees were not recognized by Jesus, then why would he go to the temple in its commemoration?</p>	
<p>John 10:22 And it was the feast of the dedication at Jerusalem: and it was winter. 23 And Jesus walked in the temple, in Solomon's porch.</p>	